

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 09235058 6



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

CONSTITUTIONAL LITIGATION
CASES AND MATERIALS Volume I

Professor L. Weinrib

Fall Term 2012

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

STORAGE

KE
4218.5
.W46
2012
v.1
c.1

THESE MATERIALS ARE REPRODUCED AS CLASS READINGS

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 31 2012

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Constitutional Litigation

Volume I

Fall term 2012

Lorraine Weinrib



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/constitutionalli01wein_7

CONSTITUTIONAL LITIGATION
FIRST TERM 2012-3

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME 1:

Page

I. Introduction

1. Constitutional Adjudication appellate and reference cases

P. Hogg, Constitutional Law of Canada, "The Supreme Court of Canada"	1
Chart of the Canadian Court System	28
<i>Ref. re Same-Sex Marriage</i> , SCC (2004), challenge to reference jurisdiction	29
Provincial Reference Cases:	
Saskatchewan Marriage Commissioners' Reference, Orders in Council (Sask. C.A.).....	35
British Columbia Reference on constitutionality of polygamy – assorted material.....	47
Ref. Re Constitutionality of s.293 of <i>Criminal Code</i> – (Polygamy Reference), (B.C. Sup. Ct) parties and funding	56

2. The Supreme Court of Canada

Statistics 2001-11, Supreme Court of Canada.....	74
Selected Upcoming cases for 2012-3	81
Chart, Appeal Process within the Supreme Court of Canada.....	86
Rules of the SCC – Motion of State Constitutional Question	87
Songer, "Understanding the Decision-Making Process [in the SCC]"	98

3. Oral and Written Advocacy

Justice J. Laskin, "Forget the Wind Up and Make the Pitch..."	114
R. Outerbridge, "Tactics for Written and Oral Advocacy..."	130
Justice J. Fichaud, "How to Catch the Judge's Wave"	137
Justice J. Laskin, "What persuades ..."	142
Justice I Binnie, "A Survivor's Guide to Advocacy in the SCC"	148

II. The Anatomy of a Charter Case: The Main Actors

4. The Attorney General and Minister of Justice

Hon R.R.McMurtry, "The Office of the Attorney General"	161
G. Mitchell, "The Role of the Attorney General"	165
L. Sterling "The Charter's Impact on the Legislative Process"	179
James B. Kelly, "Governing with the Charter of Rights"	186
Chrisopher McCrudden, "Mainstreaming Human Rights.....	204
Shawn McCarthy, The Globe and Mail, "The War on Terror", October 16, 2001.....	209
Transcript ..Proceeding, Supreme Court of Canada, <i>Miron v. Trudel</i> , undated.....	211
M. Hennigar, "Judicial Activism or Compliance? Federal Govt Concessions..." (2008)	220
Matthew Hennigar, "Conceptualizing Attorney General Conduct in Charter Litigation" 2008	239
Statutes & Rules (Federal and Ontario)	
<i>Department of Justice Act</i>	262A
Canadian Charter...Examination Regulation SC Act: References by GIC	264
Reference Jurisdiction Supreme Court Act.....	266
<i>Ministry of the Attorney General Act</i> , Ontario	267
<i>Courts of Justice Act</i> , s. 109 Notice of Constitutional Question (Ontario).....	269
Rule 4.11, Notice of Constitutional Question.....	271
Notice of Constitutional Question, Form 4F.....	272

5. The Rights Claimant: Initiating and Sustaining A Charter Case

a) Standing

Dale Gibson, “Enforcement of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms”	273
David W. Stratas, “What’s New in Charter Remedies”	287
<i>Borowski v. A.G. Canada et al.</i> , [1989] S.C.R. 342, 57 D.L.R. (4th) 231	288
<i>Canadian Council of Churches v. The Queen and the Minister of Employment and Immigration</i> , [1992] S.C.R. 236	291
<i>Vriend v. Alberta</i> [1998] 1 S.C.R. 493, extract	298
<i>Chaoulli v. Quebec</i> [2005] 1 S.C.R. 791, extract	301
<i>Morgentaler v. New Brunswick</i> , [2008] N.B.J. No 279 (Q.B.)	305
<i>Bedford v. Canada (A.G.)</i> , 2010 ONSC 4264 paras. 44-62	313
<i>PHS Community Services Society v. Canada (A.G.)</i> , 2010, BCCA 15, per Huddard J.	318

b) Mootness

<i>Borowski v. Canada</i> [1989] S.C.R. 342, extract	319
<i>New Brunswick v. G. (J.)</i> , ... [1999] 3 S.C.R. 46, extract	325
<i>Doucet-Boudreau v. Nova Scotia</i> , [2003] 3 S.C.R. 3, extract	329

6. Intervention & Amicus Curiae

George Williams, “The Amicus Curiae and Intervener in the High Court of Australia: A Comparative Analysis”	333
<i>M. v. H.</i> , Endorsement dated Aug 6 th , 1996	343
<i>Halpern v. Canada</i> , [2001] O.J. No. 879	346
<i>Halpern v. A.G. Canada</i> , Ontario Court of Appeal March 5, 2003	352
<i>Re D.B. and Her Majesty the Queen</i> , Ontario Court of Appeal, Endorsement	355
<i>Benoit v. Canada</i> , Federal Court of Appeal	357
<i>Bedford v. Canada (A.G.)</i> , 2009 (“Prostitution Challenge”), Sup Ct of Justice, Ont	363
<i>Bedford v. Canada (A.G.)</i> , 2009 (“Prostitution Challenge”), Ont. C.A.	371
Ian Brodie, <i>Friends of the Court (extract)</i>	374
Sandra Rodgers, “Getting Heard: Leave to Appeal, Interveners and Procedural Barriers To Social Justice in the Supreme Court of Canada”	391

VOLUME II:

III. Mounting A Charter Case

7. Process and Procedure

D. Elliott, “Eeny Choice of Process in Charter Claims”	1
C. Charney and L. Sterling, Civil Procedure in Charter Litigation	14
C. Bredt and M. Dwyer, “Charter Litigation: Forum and Process”	29
<i>Eaton v. Brant County Board of Education</i> (1997), 142 D.L.R. 4 th 385	42
<i>Bell ExpressVu Limited Partnership v. Rex</i> , [2002] 2 S.C.R. 559, extract	46
<i>PHS Community Services Society v. Canada (A.G.)</i> , 2010 BCCA 15, at paras 180-183	51
<i>R. v. Conway</i> , 1010 SCC 22, [2010] 1 S.C.R. 765 (Charter jurisdiction of administrative tribunals)	52
Statement by Justice Minister re stay in Bedford Prostitution Challenge (Dec 2, 2010)	58
<i>Bedford v. Canada (A.G.)</i> , 2010 ONCA 814 – stay of remedial order pending appeal	Blackboard
B.C. Appeal Court upholds exemption from doctor-assisted suicide ban	59
R. D. Elliott, “Fringe Benefits: Class Actions for Marginalized People in Canada”	60

8. Evidence

R. Charney, “Evidence in Charter Cases: Expert Evidence and Proving Purpose” ..	88
R. Charney and S. Green, “Prophets of Doom ...20 Years of Expert Evidence under The <i>Oakes</i> Test”	108
Sarah Kraicer, “Charter Evidence”	121
D. Merkur, “Expert Witnesses – New Duties”	128
<i>R. v. Malmo-Levine; R. v. Caine</i> , [2003] 3 S.C.R. 571, extract.....	135
<i>Reference re Same-Sex Marriage</i> , [2004] 3 S.C.R. 698, extract.....	139
<i>Newfoundland (Treasury Board) v. N.A.P.E.</i> , [2004] 3 S.C.R. 381, extract	144
<i>R. v. Spence</i> , [2005] 3 S.C.R. 458, extract	148
<i>Canada (A.G.) v. Bedford</i> (Ont. C.A.), dissent	152

9. Remedies

Dale Gibson, “Enforcement of the Canadian Charter ...” (2005), 28 S.C.L.R. (2d)	168
Shandal, “Combining Remedies under s. 24 of the Charter and s. 52 ...”	193
Kastner & Lokan, “Constitutional Exemptions”.....	216
<i>Rodriguez v. A.G. Canada</i> , [1993] 3 S.C.R. 519	238
<i>Eldridge v. A.G. B.C.</i> , [1997] Can. Sup. Ct. Lexis 86	245
<i>R. v. Corbiere</i> 1999 Can. Sup. Ct. LEXIS 25.....	246
<i>Manitoba Provincial Judges’ Association v. Manitoba (Minister of Justice</i> [1997] 3 S.C.R.....	250
<i>Vriend v. Alberta</i> [1998] 1 S.C.R. 493.....	257
<i>Kingstreet Investments v. New Brunswick</i> , [2007] 1 S.C.R. 3.....	267
<i>R. v. Ferguson</i> , [2008] 1 S.C.R. 96	274
<i>A.G. Canada v. Hislop</i> , [2007] 1 S.C.R. 429	283
P. Vickery, “Retroactive and Retrospective Charter Remedies: ... Class Actions”	300
C. Schmitz, “Top court’s restriction of Charter remedies ..”	313
<i>Vancouver v. Ward</i> , 2010 SCC 27, [2010] 2 S.C.R. 28	316

10. Funding Charter Litigation:

(a) cost orders

Ontario Rules of Civil Procedure, Cost rules	328
J.Arvey and A. Latimer, “Cost Strategies for Litigants...”	331
<i>M. v. H.</i> , [1999] 2. S.C.R. 3.....	354
Newspaper Coverage on the <i>Little Sisters</i> #2.....	357
<i>Little Sisters</i> #2, [2007] 1 S.C.R. 38	369

(b) public funding: Court Challenges Program (Blackboard)

